

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084081 8

The material reproduced
herein is intended for
the sole use of students
registered in the seminar,
Children and the Law.

CHILDREN AND THE LAW

edited by

Bernard Green

August 1983

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO


The material reproduced
herein is intended for
the sole use of students
registered in the seminar,
Children and the Law.

CHILDREN AND THE LAW

edited by

Bernard Green

August 1983



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/childrenlaw00gree_6

I deeply appreciate the contribution of my research assistant, Ian Arellano, a student in this Faculty, to the preparation of this casebook.

The following also assisted in the preparation of the casebook: Teresa Klimushko and Pat Ward.

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

A.	<u>General</u>	1
	Introduction	1
	Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms	2
	Marks, "Detours on the Road to Maturity"	5
	Moonkin & Coons, "Toward a Theory of Children's Rights"	13
	Brant, "The Child's Right to Privacy"	19
B.	<u>Children and Medical Services</u>	24
	Wadlington, Minors and Health Care	24
	Globe and Mail	30
	Landau, Barriers to Consent to Treatment	31
	Bowker, Minors and Mental Incompetents	38
	Green & Paul, "Parenthood and the Mentally Retarded"	46
	Re D	51
	Globe & Mail	54

CHAPTER TWO: CHILD WELFARE LEGISLATION

A.	<u>Introduction</u>	56
	Min. Comm & Soc. Services, The Children's Act	57
	Ont. Assoc. C.A.S. Response	59
	Moonkin, "Child-Custody Adjudication: Judicial Functions in the Face of Indeterminacy"	62
B.	<u>Jurisdiction</u>	83
	(a) <u>Introduction</u>	83
	Sypnowich, Society's Child	83
	(b) <u>Voluntary</u>	
	Child Welfare Act	92
	Min. Comm & Soc. Serv., The Children's Act	95
	Ont. Assoc. C.A.S., Response	114
	(c) <u>Involuntary</u>	
	Child Welfare Act	120
	Wald, "State Intervention on Behalf of Neglected Children"	123
	Ex parte D	148
	Globe and Mail	154
	Re C.A.S. Kingston and H and G	156
	*Re Metro Toronto C.A.S. and Pamela M	160

	Min. Comm. & Soc. Serv., Children's Act	167
	Ont. Assoc. (A.S., Response	170
C.	<u>Process: lawyers and legal rights</u>	171
	Child Welfare Act	171
	Dickens, "The Child in the Courts"	178
	<u>Re W</u>	203
	<u>Re C</u>	206
	<u>Re C.A.S. Kingston and H and G</u>	213
	Min. Comm & Soc. Serv. Children's Act	214
D.	<u>Disposition</u>	215
	(a) <u>Process: experts and prediction</u>	215
	Child Welfare Act	215
	Dershowitz, "On 'Preventive Detention'"	218
	Sypnowich, Society's Child	226
	(b) <u>Power</u>	238
	Child Welfare Act	238
	<u>Re C.A.S. Kingston and H and G</u>	240
	<u>Re W.P.D.W.</u>	242
	<u>Hansen v. Hamilton C.A.S.</u>	246
	Ministry of Community and Social Services, "Foster Care"	250
	Min. Comm & Soc. Serv., Children's Act	261
	(c) <u>Reviews</u>	264
	Child Welfare Act	264
	Note, "The Custody Question and Child Neglect Rehearings"	267
	<u>Re Cordes-Saathoff et al and C.C.A.S. of Metro Toronto</u>	273
	Min. Comm. & Soc. Serv., Children's Act	276
	Child Welfare Act	
E.	<u>Child Abuse</u>	277
	(a) <u>The statutory framework</u>	278
	Criminal Code	280
	(b) <u>Reasonable force</u>	
	<u>Haberstock</u>	284
	<u>Sarwer-Fower</u>	287
	<u>Baptiste</u>	290
	(c) <u>The nature of child abuse</u>	292
	Greenland, "Child Abuse in Ontario"	292
	Zigler, "Controlling Child Abuse in America"	301

(d) <u>State intervention</u>	307
Schucter, Child Abuse Intervetion	307
Globe and Mail	311
Greenland, "Child Abuse in Ontario"	313
Helfer, "Why Most Physicians Don't Get Involved in Child Abuse Cases"	320

CHAPTER THREE: JUVENILE DELINQUENCY

A. <u>Introduction</u>	325
President's Comm. on Law Enforcement and Admin. of Justice	326
Task force Report: Juvenile Delinquency and Youth Crime	
B. <u>The Legislation</u>	335
(1) <u>Canada</u>	335
<u>Juvenile Delinquents Act and Young Offenders Act</u>	335
Min of Comm. & Soc. Services, The Children's Act	362
(2) <u>Sweden</u>	374
Bolin, Measures to Combat Juvenile Delinquency in Sweden	374
C. <u>The Issues</u>	390
(1) <u>Process: The Charter of Rights</u>	390
C.B. v Kimelman	390
Re Southam Inc. and the Queen	393
Rv S.B.	402
Reg v M	406
Reg v W	414
(2) <u>Waiver</u>	420
Reg v M.K.	420
Re CRW	426
Green, The Disposition of Juvenile Offence	430
D. <u>Diversion</u>	440
Rojek and Erickson, "Reforming and Juvenile Justice System"	440
E. <u>Resources</u>	447
Sub-Committee Report on the Constitution of Committee on the Judiciary	447
Ministry of Community and Social Services, "Foster Care"	453

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

A. General

Introduction

In ordinary usage, "children" can refer to two different groups: one group characterized by age, the other by a legal relationship between the child and another person, his or her parent.

Our society has determined that a person does not have complete legal rights until he or she has reached a certain age. In this province, by the Age of Majority and Accountability Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 7, a person is vested with full legal capacity at age 18. The eighteen-year-old can vote, marry without parental consent, enter into contracts, etc. But he or she cannot obtain a drink legally in any bar in Ontario until the following year.

Fixing the age for majority at 18 does not answer many questions: (1) At what age shall we allow young people to drive? To leave school? At what age should a person be fully responsible before the criminal law? (2) Does whatever answer you or society gives answer the question, at what age a person should be allowed to obtain an abortion?

Your answer to the last question may be affected by the second meaning that "children" has, i.e., a legal relationship between the "child" and another person, his or her parent. In our society, the legal relationship is normally a product of biology: a parent-child relationship is created as a result of a man and a woman entering into a relationship which produced a child. The usual non-biological method of creating the parent-child relationship is by adoption. See Part IV of the Child Welfare Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 66.

The issues we explore in this seminar involve basic problems of political philosophy. More particularly, we are concerned with the allocation of power between the state, the parents and the child. The historical background is provided in the article by Marks, "Detours on the Road to Maturity," (reproduced below); the basic issues are posed in the article by Mnookin and Coons, "Toward a Theory of Children's Rights," (reproduced below). We focus on one specific problem, that of minor's consent to medical procedures.

The response of the legal system to issues involving children may be affected by the introduction into Canadian law of the Charter of Rights and Freedoms, reproduced below.

CHAPTER TWO: CHILD WELFARE LEGISLATION

A. Introduction

Every jurisdiction in North America has legislation that authorizes the state to intervene in the life of the family by removing the child from his or her home if certain conditions are satisfied. Ontario is no exception. The Child Welfare Act, although revised very recently, betrays its nineteenth century origins; see, for example, s. 19(1).

Among the questions you should consider are the following:

(1) In what circumstances is the state justified in removing the child from his home? (2) Should this decision be based on a cost-benefit analysis - i.e., if the costs (to whom?) outweigh the benefits (to whom?), should the state refuse to intervene? (3) Is it possible to determine the costs and benefits? (See Mnookin, "Child-Custody Adjudication," reproduced herein.) (4) Is the state concerned about the present situation, or is it really concerned about the future consequences of the present situation? (5) If the latter, do we have an accurate means of predicting future human behaviour? (See Dershowitz, "On Preventive Detention," reproduced herein.)

CHAPTER THREE: JUVENILE DELINQUENCY

A. Introduction

Every (Western) society has had to decide how it will handle persons who are not adults when they have engaged in criminal activity. The responses have taken two basic forms: (1) The North American: on this continent, we have established specialized courts with a special process and special dispositional powers to deal with part of this group. (See the Young Offenders Act, reproduced below. In conjunction with the Young Offenders Act, we have reproduced its predecessor, the Juvenile Delinquents Act. We have done so because the Young Offenders Act has not yet been proclaimed; the cases we reproduce were decided under the Juvenile Delinquents Act.) Those who are above the maximum age for juvenile court jurisdiction are subject to the ordinary process, i.e., trial in adult criminal court.

(2) In some European countries, young people who would be processed in juvenile court in Canada are handled by the ordinary child welfare system. Note that in these countries, too, there is a gap. Thus, in Sweden, the age of criminal responsibility is 15 and anyone 15 years of age or older can be tried in the ordinary criminal courts. See "Measures to Combat Juvenile Delinquency in Sweden," paragraphs 21-24, reproduced below.

